



County Hall
Cardiff
CF10 4UW
Tel: (029) 2087 2000

Neuadd y Sir
Caerdydd
CF10 4UW
Ffôn: (029) 2087 2000

AGENDA

Committee	ECONOMY & CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE
Date and Time of Meeting	THURSDAY, 6 DECEMBER 2018, 4.30 PM
Venue	COMMITTEE ROOM 4 - COUNTY HALL
Membership	Councillor Howells (Chair) Councillors Henshaw, Gordon, Gavin Hill-John, Parkhill, Robson, Sattar, Simmons and Stubbs

Time approx.

1 Apologies for Absence

To receive apologies for absence.

2 Declarations of Interest

To be made at the start of the agenda item in question, in accordance with the Members' Code of Conduct.

3 Minutes (Pages 3 - 6)

To approve as a correct record the minutes of the meeting held on 8 November 2018.

4 Employment Services (Pages 7 - 12)

4.30 pm

To review impact of recent changes – presentation and Q&A

5 Economic Development White Paper (Pages 13 - 28)

5.15 pm

To receive the report to Cabinet scheduled for 13 December 2018 and to scrutinise the proposals set out in the White Paper – presentation and Q&A.
(Appendix D – to follow)

6 Committee Business (Pages 29 - 40)

5.45 pm

This document is available in Welsh / Mae'r ddogfen hon ar gael yn Gymraeg

By receiving this Agenda Pack electronically you have saved the Authority approx. £1.10 in printing costs

7 Urgent Items (if any)

8 Way Forward

6.15 pm

To review the evidence and information gathered during consideration of each agenda item, agree Members comments, observations and concerns to be passed on to the relevant Cabinet Member by the Chair, and to note items for inclusion on the Committee's Forward Work Programme.

9 Date of next meeting

17 January 2019 at 4.30pm.

Davina Fiore

Director Governance & Legal Services

Date: Friday, 30 November 2018

Contact: Andrea Redmond, 02920 872434, a.redmond@cardiff.gov.uk

ECONOMY & CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

8 NOVEMBER 2018

Present: Councillor Howells(Chairperson)
Councillors Henshaw, Parkhill, Robson, Sattar and Stubbs

30 : APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies were received from Councillor Gavin Hill-John.

31 : DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

None received.

32 : MINUTES

The minutes of the meeting held on 11th October 2018 were agreed as a correct record and signed by the Chairperson.

33 : EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

RESOLVED – That the public be excluded from the meeting for consideration of a number of Appendices for the following items as they contained exempt information as detailed in paragraphs 14 and 21 of Schedule 12a of the Local Government Act 1972.

34 : SECURING INVESTMENT INTO COUNCIL-OWNED HERITAGE BUILDINGS

The Chairperson advised Members that this item is to enable pre-decision scrutiny of the report to Cabinet on securing the future of Cardiff's heritage buildings. The scope of the scrutiny was to examine the recommendations to Cabinet, the financial assumptions in the report, whether there are any risks to the Council, the timeline and the next steps for securing the future of our heritage buildings.

The Chairperson welcomed Cllr Peter Bradbury, Cabinet Member Culture & Leisure, Cllr Russell Goodway, Cabinet Member Investment & Development, and Neil Hanratty, Director of Economic Development.

The Chairperson moved that the presentation and discussion of this item be heard in closed session as it contained confidential information by virtue of paragraph 14 of Part 4 and paragraph 21 of Part 5 of Schedule 12a of the Local Government Act 1972.

The Chairperson moved that Committee resolve to exclude the Press and Public from the meeting at this point.

RESOLVED: that the views of the Committee would be discussed during the way forward section of the meeting and a letter sent to the Cabinet Member in due course.

35 : LAND AT HARBOUR DRIVE

The Chairperson advised that this item was to enable pre-decision scrutiny of the report to Cabinet on acquiring a strategic site in Cardiff Bay, known as Britannia Park, and selling a portion of this land. The scope of the scrutiny was to examine the recommendations to Cabinet, the financial assumptions in the report, whether there are any risks to the Council, the timeline and the next steps for acquiring and selling this land.

The Chairperson welcomed Cllr Russell Goodway, Cabinet Member Investment & Development, and Neil Hanratty, Director of Economic Development.

The Chairperson moved that the presentation and discussion of this item be heard in closed session as it contained confidential information by virtue of paragraph 14 of Part 4 and paragraph 21 of Part 5 of Schedule 12a of the Local Government Act 1972.

The Chairperson moved that Committee resolve to exclude the Press and Public from the meeting at this point.

RESOLVED: that the views of the Committee would be discussed during the way forward section of the meeting and a letter sent to the Cabinet Member in due course.

36 : MULTI-PURPOSE INDOOR ARENA

The Chairperson advised Members that this item was to enable pre-decision scrutiny of the report to Cabinet on the multi-purpose indoor arena. The scope of our scrutiny was to examine the recommendations to Cabinet, the financial assumptions in the report, whether there are any risks to the Council, the timeline and the next steps for delivering the arena.

The Chairperson welcomed Cllr Russell Goodway, Cabinet Member Investment & Development, and Neil Hanratty, Director of Economic Development.

The Chairperson moved that the presentation and discussion of this item be heard in closed session as it contained confidential information by virtue of paragraph 14 of Part 4 and paragraph 21 of Part 5 of Schedule 12a of the Local Government Act 1972.

The Chairperson moved that Committee resolve to exclude the Press and Public from the meeting at this point.

RESOLVED: that the views of the Committee would be discussed during the way forward section of the meeting and a letter sent to the Cabinet Member in due course.

37 : COMMITTEE BUSINESS

Members were provided with a correspondence update and were advised that the correspondence was up to date as of the October Scrutiny meeting, there were just two responses awaited from that meeting.

Members were provided with the 'Council Workshops & Innovation Premises' Inquiry draft report and were advised that this was their opportunity to advise of any changes required or to approve the draft report for submission to Cabinet. The Chairperson wished to thank Angela Holt Principal Scrutiny Officer for her work and support with the inquiry and he also thanked the members of the Task and Finish Group for their contribution. Committee agreed for the draft report to be submitted to Cabinet following the completion of the Chairs' Foreword.

Members were advised that on 19 February 2019, the Committee meeting would be dedicated to the consideration of the Corporate Plan and Budgetary Proposals 2019/20. All Members of the Council would be offered the opportunity of a briefing on these issues. The Scrutiny Officer asked Committee Members if they required any further targeted training on scrutinising the Corporate Plan and Budgetary Proposals. Some Members indicated that they would welcome refresher training and others asked for the training slides from last year to be circulated. Members also felt that it would be useful to have specific training on how best to scrutinise capital programme proposals and capital financing costs.

Members were updated with regards to the work plan and advised that a work programme report would be brought to Committee scheduled for the 6 December 2018.

38 : URGENT ITEMS (IF ANY)

None received.

39 : WAY FORWARD

Members discussed the information received and identified a number of issues which the Chairman agreed would be included in the letters that would be sent, on behalf of the Committee, to the relevant Cabinet Members and Officers.

40 : DATE OF NEXT MEETING

Joint Scrutiny meeting with the Environmental Scrutiny Committee 19th November at 5.30pm in CR4, County Hall.

Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee 6th December 2018 at 4.30pm in CR4, County Hall.

The meeting terminated at 7.15 pm

This page is intentionally left blank

**CYNGOR CAERDYDD
CARDIFF COUNCIL**

ECONOMY & CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

6 DECEMBER 2018

EMPLOYMENT SERVICES IN CARDIFF: POLICY REVIEW SCRUTINY

Purpose of the Report

1. To give Members background information to aid policy review scrutiny of Employment Services in Cardiff.

Background

2. Following a review of its anti-poverty schemes, the Welsh Government Communities First programme ended on 31 March 2018. In preparation for this, Cardiff Council undertook a review of Employment Services in Cardiff and carried out consultation on proposals for future services. These concluded that:

‘..there is a need to changes services in Cardiff to improve accessibility, link together the many existing services and ensure that help is available to everyone who needs it, across the city.’¹

3. At their meeting on 16 November 2017, Cabinet agreed the following recommendations:
 - a) *‘Agree the approach to future delivery of Employment Services as set out in the report.*
 - b) *‘Delegate authority to the Director of Housing, Communities and Customer Service to take the necessary actions to implement the new Employability Service and transitional arrangements.*

¹ Point 13 of Report to Cabinet, *‘Development of a city wide employability provision & a new approach to building resilient communities’*, 16 November 2017

- c) *Authorise officers to review the approach to Building Resilient Communities programme, including a public consultation exercise, to inform a proposed way forward for Cabinet consideration.*
4. The new Employment Service comprises services directly provided by the Council. Access to the service is via a Gateway, which includes phone, internet and face-to-face access, available through community hubs, libraries and other community buildings. The Employment Service includes:
- a) in-depth mentoring and support;
 - b) support for self-employed people and those starting a social enterprise;
 - c) job clubs;
 - d) assistance with CVs and job searches;
 - e) support to those in low-paid employment and on zero hour contracts;
 - f) effective employer engagement;
 - g) opportunities for volunteering;
 - h) work experience placements; and
 - i) the monitoring of services via a single database.
5. The new approach brings together various funding streams, including '*Communities for Work*², the '*Employability Grant*³, '*Legacy Funding*⁴ and the Council's own Into Work resources to create one service provided directly by Council employees. The Welsh Government also made available £4 million Community Facilities Programme funding, where third sector organisations could submit bids to Welsh Government for capital grant funding for facilities that contribute to the community.
6. The aim of developing a single database was to provide one view of an individual to measure the success of interventions and outcomes, as well as to identify gaps or duplication in service across the city.

² Communities for Work is European Support funding of £583,610 per annum until 2020

³ Employability Grant is Welsh Government funding, of between £650,000 - £750,000 for 2018/19

⁴ Legacy Funding is Welsh Government funding of £563,361 for 2018-19

7. The Employment Service works with Economic Development to link with national and local employers to identify future skills requirements and inform future training provision.
8. Critically, the new approach recognises that a proactive approach is required to engage those individuals who do not feel able to seek help. The new service links to job centres, community centres, social landlords, health and hostel services and foodbanks to identify clients in need of the service. It also targets those most in need, such as those affected by Universal Credit and other welfare reforms.

Q1 and Q2 Performance

9. The Corporate Quarter 2 performance report, taken to Cabinet on 15 November 2018, includes the following information:

- a) **The number of people receiving into work advice through the Gateway:**

- i. Quarter 1 10,331
- ii. Quarter 2 11,395

- b) **The number of clients that have been supported into employment, having received tailored support through the gateway:**

- i. Quarter 1 252
- ii. Quarter 2 197

- c) **The number of employers that have been assisted by the Council's employment support services:**

- i. Quarter 1 87
- ii. Quarter 2 87

10. The Corporate Quarter 2 performance report states that nearly 100 people attended a Pop up Business School held in the centre of Cardiff for two weeks, resulting in 62 new start-up businesses being created.

11. The Corporate Quarter 2 performance report also states that there is a projected £60,000 underspend against Employability Services as a result of savings against employee budgets and additional income.

Previous Scrutiny

12. This Committee undertook policy development scrutiny of the Employment Services proposals at their meeting on 14 September 2017 and pre-decision scrutiny of the subsequent report to Cabinet in November 2017. Overall, Members were supportive of the proactive approach adopted to the cessation of Communities First funding.

13. Following their meeting in September 2017, Members:

- a) Highlighted the need to ensure marketing of the new gateway approach provides reassurance to potential service users regarding its independence and helpfulness;
- b) Stressed the need to ensure systems are in place to engage potential service users who face difficulties accessing employment services;
- c) Requested a progress report on mapping ESOL provision and accessing additional funding.

14. A copy of the Chair's letter and the response received was attached at Appendix 1 of the report to Cabinet, with the information requested on ESOL provision included in Appendix 4 of the Cabinet report. The report to Cabinet also contained a separate section detailing the work that would take place to engage potential hard to reach services users.

15. Following pre-decision scrutiny of the report to Cabinet in November 2017, the Chair wrote to Councillor Thorne, Cabinet Member – Housing and Communities, stating the Committee's support of the recommendations to Cabinet. The Chair's letter also detailed Members' concerns that the respondents to the consultation on changes to Employment Services did not include more people seeking work or employment-related support and recommending that future consultation

exercises use different research methods to reach those most affected and enable their voices to be heard.

Way Forward

16. Councillor Lynda Thorne (Cabinet Member – Housing and Communities) will be invited to make a statement. Jane Thomas (Assistant Director, Communities and Housing) and Helen Evans (Operational Manager – Advice & Benefits) will attend to give a presentation and answer Members' questions on employment services in Cardiff.

Legal Implications

17. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters, there are no direct legal implications. However, legal implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any legal implications arising from those recommendations. All decisions taken by or on behalf of the Council must (a) be within the legal powers of the Council; (b) comply with any procedural requirement imposed by law; (c) be within the powers of the body or person exercising powers on behalf of the Council; (d) be undertaken in accordance with the procedural requirements imposed by the Council e.g. Scrutiny Procedure Rules; (e) be fully and properly informed; (f) be properly motivated; (g) be taken having regard to the Council's fiduciary duty to its taxpayers; and (h) be reasonable and proper in all the circumstances.

Financial Implications

18. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters, there are no direct financial implications at this stage in relation to any of the work programme. However, financial implications may arise if and when the matters under review are

implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any financial implications arising from those recommendations.

RECOMMENDATION

The Committee is recommended to:

- i) Consider the information in this report and the information presented at the meeting;
- ii) Determine whether they would like to make any comments, observations or recommendations to the Cabinet on this matter; and
- iii) Decide the way forward for any future scrutiny of the issues discussed.

DAVINA FIORE

Director of Governance & Legal Services

30 November 2018

**CYNGOR CAERDYDD
CARDIFF COUNCIL**

ECONOMY & CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

30 November 2018

Economic Development White Paper: Pre-Decision Scrutiny

Purpose of Report

1. To provide Members of this Committee with background information ahead of their scrutiny of the Economic Development White Paper, which is scheduled in the Council's published Forward Plan¹ for Cabinet on 13 December 2018.

Background

2. At Council on 28 September 2017, Councillor Russell Goodway gave a commitment to bring forward a Green Paper on Economic Development:

*'the new Administration's programme, set out in the Capital Ambition document, commits to the publication of a Green Paper designed to build a consensus across all sectors and stakeholders on the future economic vision for the city. The Leader of the County Council has made it clear to me that he is eager to achieve the widest possible ownership of the County's resulting economic development agenda... I will seek the Lord Mayor's permission to schedule an appropriate discussion on the Green Paper at a future meeting of the County Council to ensure that all elected members have an opportunity to influence the future policy direction.'*²

3. Councillor Goodway launched the Green Paper for consultation at Council on 30th November 2017. The relevant extract from his statement is provided below:

¹ Available at: <http://cardiff.moderngov.co.uk/mgListPlanItems.aspx?PlanId=81&RP=151&LLL=0>

² Minutes of Full Council 28 September 2017

The County Administration is, today, publishing its promised Investment & Development Green Paper "*Building More and Better Jobs*" which will form the basis of an extensive consultation exercise designed to generate a refreshed economic development agenda for our nation's capital city and its hinterland. This honours the commitment set out in the Administration's recently published policy document *Capital Ambition*.

The publication marks the beginning of a three-month consultation period which will allow local residents, businesses and all those that depend on the Cardiff economy the opportunity help shape an ambitious agenda aimed at rebuilding the momentum of Wales' economic dynamo. The Green Paper is available online and can be accessed via the Council's website.

A series of meetings and events will be held over the next three months designed to allow the greatest possible engagement with those who want to influence and inform the development of a White Paper to be published next year. I will seek an opportunity for the Council to debate the Green Paper in January to ensure that every member has the opportunity to contribute to this important exercise.

It is clear that the Council has much to do to rebuild its relationship with the private sector which we will need to rely on to help deliver the ambitious agenda that is so critical to Cardiff and Wales in the post-Brexit era. The Council has done this successfully in the past, but it is dependent on providing confidence and clarity in the direction that our city is heading. This Green Paper will trigger the start of that process.

4. The Green Paper was debated at Full Council on 25 January 2018, as per the Council's procedure rules, set out at Point 21, Council Meeting Procedure Rules, Council Constitution (*pages 135-136*).
5. The '*Building More and Better Jobs*' Green Paper outlined the aims, objectives and intentions of the Administration with regard to economic development. It set out key issues and aspects regarding future investment and development in Cardiff and sought respondents' views on a series of questions related to these.
6. The Administration's intentions were set out in the Green Paper as:
 - Build a more Connected Capital
 - Build on our success as a Business Capital
 - Develop a more Inclusive Capital
 - Build a Smarter City.

7. The Green Paper set out the case for competitive cities and highlighted the need to consider a post-Brexit future and how Cardiff responds to this. The aims and objectives for a competitive city economy were listed as:

- | | |
|-----------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| ▲ Productivity | ▼ People out of work |
| ▲ Jobs | ▼ People paid less than living wage |
| ▲ Business Investment | ▼ NEETs |
| ▲ Investment in Communities | ▼ Economic leakage |
| ▲ Visitors | ▼ Congestion |
| ▲ Infrastructure Investment | ▼ Inequality |
| ▲ Earnings | |

8. The Green Paper also sought the views of respondents on a spatial strategy for the city, proposing the following focus for developments:

- City Centre –business/ office-led mixed use development
- Cardiff Bay –leisure–led infrastructure development
- North Cardiff –innovation/ knowledge led growth
- East Cardiff – industry/ manufacturing, distribution and trade related
- West Cardiff – sport- led infrastructure development.

9. The Green Paper asked respondents for their views on the following:

Q1 - What are the key issues for the Cardiff economy?

Q2 - What should be the key indicators of success for Cardiff?

Q3 - What should Cardiff's role be in the city-region?

Q4 - How can we continue to engage with Europe in a post-Brexit era?

Q5 - What can we do to improve connectivity?

Q6 - How can we create more and better jobs?

Q7 - How can everyone benefit from growth?

Q8 - How can we become a smarter city?

Q9 - What should Cardiff's spatial strategy be?

Q10 - What can we do to support business development in the city centre?

Q11 - What can we do to support leisure activities in the Bay?

Q12 - What can we do to develop Cardiff West as a sporting destination?

Q13 - What opportunities are there to support industry in Cardiff East?

Q14 - What opportunities are there to support innovation in North Cardiff?

Q15 - How should we use events to support the city's economy?

Q16 - How can we make sure everyone benefits from growth in Cardiff?

Economic Development White Paper

10. The Council's published Cabinet Forward Plan lists the Economic Development White Paper as scheduled for Cabinet on 13 December 2018. The descriptor for the item, attached at **Appendix A**, states that '*In 2017 the Council published 'More and Better Jobs', an Economic Strategy Green Paper. This reports back on the consultation process and presents the subsequent White Paper.*'

11. The report to Cabinet is marked as Amber in the Scrutiny consideration section; at 15.2, Part 4 Rules of Procedure, the Council's Constitution states that
 - (i) *Green = Decisions of a non-contentious, day to day nature, unlikely to be the subject of call-in.*
 - (ii) *Amber = Decisions of a more sensitive nature, which could be potentially contentious or not of a routine nature. These would generally flow through to the Cabinet for decision, without prior scrutiny, although a judgement will be made in each case regarding scrutiny consideration before decision, and the possibility of call-in.*
 - (iii) *Red = Decisions relating to high level functions primarily relating to policy formulation within the Policy and Budgetary Framework where the Cabinet would usually make a proposal to Council. For such decisions, the engagement of scrutiny is required before the Cabinet recommendation is made.*

12. Any papers for this item that become available prior to Committee will be circulated to Members as **Appendix D**.

13. In line with the Council's Constitution, Councillor Russell Goodway, (Cabinet Member – Investment & Development), Neil Hanratty (Director of Economic Development) and Ken Poole (Head of Economic Development) have been given ten days notification that they were required to attend Committee for this item.

Previous Scrutiny

14. In 2013, the Committee held a workshop to scrutinise '*Rebuilding Momentum: A Green Paper on the Future of Cardiff's Economy*'. The Committee's response is attached at **Appendix B**, for Members information.
15. In January 2018, the Committee scrutinised the '*Building More and Better Jobs*' Consultation Green Paper. The Chair's letter is attached at **Appendix C**, for Members information.

Way Forward

16. Councillor Russell Goodway (Cabinet Member – Investment & Development) may wish to make a statement. The following officers will be in attendance to answer Members' questions:
 - Neil Hanratty (Director of Economic Development)
 - Ken Poole (Head of Economic Development).

Legal Implications

17. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct legal implications. However, legal implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any legal implications arising from those recommendations. All decisions taken by or on behalf of the Council must (a) be within the legal powers of the Council; (b) comply with any procedural requirement imposed by law; (c) be within the powers of the body or person exercising powers on behalf of the Council; (d) be undertaken in accordance with the procedural requirements imposed by the Council e.g. Scrutiny Procedure Rules; (e) be fully and

properly informed; (f) be properly motivated; (g) be taken having regard to the Council's fiduciary duty to its taxpayers; and (h) be reasonable and proper in all the circumstances.

Financial Implications

18. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct financial implications at this stage in relation to any of the work programme. However, financial implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any financial implications arising from those recommendations.

Recommendation

19. The Committee is recommended:
- a. to consider whether it wishes to pass on any comments, observations or recommendations to the Cabinet or other part of the Council;
 - b. to discuss whether it wishes to schedule any further scrutiny of these issues.

Davina Fiore
Director of Governance and Legal Services
30 November 2018

The screenshot shows a web browser window displaying the Cardiff Council website. The browser's address bar shows the URL: <http://cardiff.moderngov.co.uk/mgIssueHistoryHome.aspx?IId=15786&PlanId=81&LLL=0>. The page title is "Issue details - Economic W...". The browser's taskbar shows several open tabs, including "Next City - Inspiring Bette...", "JRF The Joseph Rowntree ...", "Monthly meetings calend...", "Councillors and Meetings ...", and "BBC - Home".

The website header features the Cardiff Council logo (a dragon) and the text "Cardiff Council" and "www.cardiff.gov.uk". Below the header is a navigation menu with links for "Home", "Resident", "Business", "Visiting", and "Your Council".

The breadcrumb trail reads: "Your Council > Councillors and Meetings > Browse forward plans > Browse plans > Forward plan > Issue".

The main content area is titled "Issue details" and "Economic White Paper". There are two tabs: "Details" (selected) and "History".

The "Details" tab contains the following information:

- Decision type:** Key
- Decision status:** For Determination
- Notice of proposed decision first published:** 14/09/2018
- Decision due:** 13 Dec 2018 by Cabinet
- Lead member:** Cabinet Member for Investment & Development
- Lead director:** Director of Economic Development
- Scrutiny Consideration:** AMBER

A sidebar on the left lists various council services: Councillors and Meetings, Cabinet, Calendar, Committees, Community councils, Council Constitution, Councillors, Decisions, Election results, Forward Plans, Library, Meetings, Outside bodies, Registers, Remuneration, and Scrutiny.

This page is intentionally left blank



**ECONOMY AND CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE
RESPONSE TO THE REBUILDING MOMENTUM: A GREEN
PAPER ON THE FUTURE OF CARDIFF'S ECONOMY**

On the 18th March the Economy and Culture Scrutiny Committee held a workshop to discuss Cardiff Council's economic vision Green Paper 'Rebuilding Momentum'. The Committee were provided with information on *Cardiff: Economic Performance*, the *Core Area Masterplan*, and discussed the new approach that was to be adopted. The following responses were provided in line with the consultation structure.

Q1. What do you think the city's priorities for economic development should be?

In discussing the potential economic development priorities the Committee noted the analysis provided by the Head of Economic Development.

It is clear that periodic economic recession, the unpredictable rise of major competitors elsewhere, unexpected business closures, the challenges arising from technological change and globalisation highlight the importance of building Cardiff's economic resilience. The resilience of Cardiff's economic systems is affected by the interconnectedness of today's economy and the Committee are of the view that there is a need for the economic approach to foster a diverse range of sectors, a mix of businesses and jobs. This balanced approach will need to be cognisant of Welsh Government priorities relating to the Enterprise Zone.

A key area for development is that of building an entrepreneurial culture in Cardiff. The metrics provided to the Committee highlighted that this is a key area for development, and it will be important for the city to harness the creativity and talent of young people in all areas of the city and foster entrepreneurship in the classroom. In improving the values, norms and attitudes of the population of a region relating to business start-ups, the development and embracing of a culture of risk-taking without fear of failure will be important.

As noted previously the development of creative industries will need to be a key feature in the economic Vision. Whilst the percentage of the population employed in creative industries in Cardiff is high, Members would like to point out the need to further increase the size/number of jobs in the sector.

It is acknowledged that there will be significant population growth over the duration of the economic vision. Within the context of Cardiff's quality of life indices and the Local Development Plan process, improving connectivity poses a key risk for economic development going forward. Improvements to the city's transport infrastructure will be required, with particular attention needed to the issue of car use.

The presentation provided to Committee highlighted that Cardiff is well placed in terms of its population with higher level qualifications, but has challenges in terms of the quality of schools. If Cardiff is to improve economically in a balanced way, it is essential that this matter is addressed to secure a broad skilled workforce.

Members were also of the view that there is a need for the strategy to focus on job creation and the central part the Council plays in this agenda. Jobs play an important role in improving well being, social cohesion and in reducing poverty issues, and it is important that any approach considers the needs of all and fully considers the socio economic and geographical perspectives.

Q2. What do you think are the most significant challenges that Cardiff faces and what are the city's greatest opportunities?

In terms of strengths and weaknesses Members discussed the need to maximise the potential of Cardiff City Football Club's promotion to the Premiership. In addition Members discussed the potential of promoting Cardiff as a regional sporting leader in the south west of the UK. In discussing the success of Cardiff in attracting major events the Committee identified complacency as a potential challenge to overcome for the future. It was also considered important for the correct mix to be achieved, and for partners to maximise the added value (social and economic benefits) associated with major events.

Universities were also identified as a major strength in Cardiff and there is a need to maximise this strength by improving the working relationships with the Council to foster an entrepreneurial culture.

The Committee recognised the success of the developments within the city centre and highlighted as a significant challenge the need to reduce the income disparities between communities via job creation

Cardiff's role as a capital city and regional centre for economic development was highlighted as a significant opportunity, and the developing city region agenda will be important opportunity for the future. Members highlighted the need to recognise the growth of Bristol and to see Bristol's 2050 business vision as significant challenge. Relationships need to be developed to ensure that the development is achieved in both city regions.

The development of Cardiff Airport is a significant challenge facing Cardiff and its region. International connectivity is a key factor in improving Cardiff's competitiveness and it will be important for Cardiff to be mindful of the potential of developing routes to key economic hubs.

Q3. Moving forward, how do you think Cardiff should build on its recent success to position itself in the UK and internationally?

From an international perspective it is clear that the possible improvements at Cardiff Airport have the potential to link with the economic focus of the Enterprise Zone - for example focussing effort on building flight links to international financial centres.

The Committee noted that Cardiff is one of Europe's youngest capital cities. Building on the 'young and vibrant capital city' approach appears to be the correct approach going forward. The Committee was also of the view that there were other potential areas for development, including Cardiff's cultural distinctiveness and the positive aspects/distinctiveness of the devolution agenda, which could also be developed.

In discussing the marketing approach it is clear that there is a need to focus more of the resources internationally being mindful of the growth of the BRICs (Brazil, Russia, India and China) in terms of inward investment. It is essential that any approach is based on strong market intelligence and robust consultation with Cardiff businesses.

Q4. Do you agree with the key infrastructure priorities for the core area and are there other priorities the Council should consider?

The Committee approved the Cardiff Metro concept and highlighted the example of Liverpool as an example of a city with good connectivity by rail.

The Committee agreed about the need to develop a convention centre, although mixed views were expressed regarding the ideal location. It was noted that a city centre site would assist in bids for large events such as the

UEFA Champions League. However, it was noted that land ownership issues might complicate this.

Q5. Do you agree with the Council's strategy to create an Integrated Transport Hub?

The Committee were supportive of the Integrated Transport Hub and the need to progress. The Committee were mindful of the context of the developing LDP and highlighted the importance of radial transport across the city.

The Lloyd George Avenue transport proposals were discussed and supported, in particular the development of a double sided street at the heart of the public transport network. The long term need of heavy rail access into the Bay was also discussed.

Q6. Do you agree with the land use zoning and densities proposed in the master-plan and the location of key infrastructure?

The Committee were particularly pleased with the opening up of the city centre by creating new open spaces such as the canal areas. Members also highlighted the importance of community facilities/local centres in holding areas together.

Q7. How this can best be achieved including the scope of any new model that is put into place?

The importance of high quality build was raised as a key issue in delivering any model. In relation to the Lloyd George Avenue proposals lessons should be learned regarding securing quality build, and innovative methods should be employed to ensure that this happens.

In relation to the potential convention centre and the potential eastern bay link, Members discussed the need to master plan the transportation infrastructure alongside developments rather than undertaking developments and risking increased congestion.

Land ownership issues were also highlighted as a potential barrier to progress and perceived bidding issues.

The Committee were concerned that the communication around such developments needed to be handled sensitively, taking into consideration the need to avoid the perception that investment is directed to the city centre only.

Q8. How can the Council better engage with the private sector and what role should the private sector play in shaping Cardiff's economic future?

In discussing the engagement of the private sector Members discussed the Cardiff and Co as an example. There were mixed views regarding the respective benefits of an arms length company (that is common practice in other cities) or an in house approach where there may be clearer lines of responsibility, with for example the Economic Development Director leading any approach. Members also discussed the need for a co-operative approach where major private sector companies were involved.

The Committee, hope that these comments support the emerging development of the City's Economic Vision.

My Ref: T: Scrutiny/Correspondence/Cllr NH



County Hall
Cardiff,
CF10 4UW
Tel: (029) 2087 2087

Neuadd y Sir
Caerdydd,
CF10 4UW
Ffôn: (029) 2087 2088

Date: 12 January 2018

Councillor Russell Goodway
Cabinet Member, Investment and Development
Cardiff Council,
County Hall
Cardiff
CF10 4UW

Dear Councillor Goodway,

Economy & Culture and Environmental Scrutiny Committee: 11 January 2018

Members of the Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee have asked me to pass on their thanks to you and officers for attending Committee to brief Members on the 'Building More and Better Jobs' Green Paper.

Members note the intention is to consult on the Green Paper across the whole of the business sector and with public sector, third sector and private sector partners, including neighbouring local authorities. Members welcome this and hope that it stimulates debate on the way forward for Cardiff and our role in the region.

Members look forward to scrutinising the planned Economic Development White Paper. As part of this, Members would like to receive a summary of the consultation responses received, to go out with our committee papers for this item and ask that officers liaise with scrutiny officers to arrange this.

Yours sincerely,

COUNCILLOR NIGEL HOWELLS
CHAIR, ECONOMY & CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

cc Members of the Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee
Neil Hanratty Ken Poole
Clair James Cabinet Support Office

This page is intentionally left blank

**CYNGOR CAERDYDD
CARDIFF COUNCIL****ECONOMY & CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE****6 DECEMBER 2018**

COMMITTEE BUSINESS REPORT

Background

1. This report provides Members with:
 - i. a correspondence update;
 - ii. an update on the Joint Overview & Scrutiny Committee – Cardiff Capital Region City Deal;
 - iii. an opportunity to discuss the Committee’s updated Work Programme 2018/18; and
 - iv. an opportunity for Members to discuss the Committee’s Forward Work Plan January – April 2019.

Correspondence update

2. Following most Committee meetings the Chair writes a letter to the relevant Cabinet Member or officer, summing up the Committee’s comments and recommendations regarding the issues considered.
3. At the Committee meeting on 8 November 2018, Members received a report detailing the correspondence sent and received up to that meeting. Since then, correspondence has been sent following the Committee meeting on 8 November 2018
4. The list below details the position with regard to responses to correspondence:
 - i. *Response Awaited* – from Councillor Russell Goodway, to the Chair’s letter following scrutiny of plans to regenerate the Dumballs Road area, considered at Committee on 11 October 2018.

- ii. *Response Awaited* – from Councillor Peter Bradbury to the Chair’s letter regarding the Cabinet Response to the Funding of Parks Inquiry report recommendations, considered at Committee on 11 October 2018.
 - iii. *Response Awaited* – from Councillor Bradbury and Councillor Goodway to the Chair’s letter regarding the report to Cabinet on Heritage Buildings, considered at Committee on 8 November 2018.
 - iv. *Response Awaited* – from Councillor Goodway to the Chair’s public letter regarding the report to Cabinet on the Indoor Arena, considered at Committee on 8 November 2018.
 - v. *No Response Required* – from Councillor Goodway to the Chair’s private letter regarding confidential aspects of the report to Cabinet on the Indoor Arena, considered at Committee on 8 November 2018.
 - vi. *No Response Required* – from Councillor Goodway to the Chair’s letter regarding the report to Cabinet on Harbour Drive, Britannia Park, considered at Committee on 8 November 2018.
 - vii. *Response Awaited* – from Councillor Peter Bradbury and Councillor Michael Michael to the letter of Councillor Ramesh Patel, Chair of the Joint Committee meeting held on 19 November to scrutinise the Public Spaces Protection Order: Dog Controls.
5. Copies of the Chair’s letters and any responses received can be found on the Council’s website page for the relevant Committee meeting, with a hyperlink provided at the top of the page, entitled ‘*correspondence following the committee meeting*’.

Joint Overview and Scrutiny Committee – Cardiff Capital Region City Deal

6. At their meeting on 19 July 2018, Full Council considered a report that sought approval for the establishment of a Joint Overview and Scrutiny Committee (JOSC) for the Cardiff Capital Region (CCR) City Deal, including agreement on who the nominated representative and deputy to the JOSC for Cardiff Council would be.

7. Full Council resolved that:
 - i. the recommendations of the Economy and Culture Scrutiny Committee with regard to the establishment of a Joint Overview and Scrutiny Committee for the Cardiff Capital Region City Deal were noted;
 - ii. the establishment of a Joint Overview and Scrutiny Committee for the Cardiff Capital Region City Deal, was approved in accordance with the report;
 - iii. the draft terms of reference for the City Deal Joint Overview and Scrutiny Committee were agreed, subject to approval by each of the other participating authorities;
 - iv. the appointment of Councillor Ramesh Patel as a non-Executive Member to be Cardiff Council's representative on the Joint Overview and Scrutiny Committee for the Cardiff Capital Region City Deal was approved;
 - v. the appointment of Councillor Nigel Howells as a non-Executive Member to be Cardiff Council's deputy representative on the Joint Overview and Scrutiny Committee for the Cardiff Capital Region City Deal was approved;
 - vi. the appointments of the Council's representative and deputy be reviewed annually;
 - vii. no additional salary shall be payable to this Council's representative, in the event that he or she is elected as Chair of the Joint Overview and Scrutiny Committee.

8. The other nine local authorities that, along with Cardiff, comprise the CCR City Deal also approved the establishment of a JOSOC and provided nominations for representatives and deputy representatives. Bridgend Council, which is paid by CCR City Deal to manage the JOSOC, set up the first training session and official meeting, held on 15 October 2018.

9. At the training session, Members heard from Kellie Beirne, Programme Director for CCR City Deal, who provided an overview of the City Deal and from Elizabeth Weale and Hrijinder Singh, Accountable Body – Cardiff Council, who provided an overview of the legal and financial framework for the City Deal.

10. At the first official meeting, the JOSOC agreed their terms of reference and discussed the scheduling of meeting, their training requirements and potential Forward Work Programme items, resulting in agreement on the following:
- i. The next meeting of the JOSOC will take place in January/ February 2019, with a site visit to the Semi- Conductor facility in Newport;
 - ii. The funding for the JOSOC will be explored to ensure there is sufficient budget in place for Members to have relevant training and to be able to fund expert witnesses to attend meetings of the JOSOC;
 - iii. Future training will assist all Members to understand the benefits and cost implications of the CCR City Deal;
 - iv. The CCR City Deal Business Plan will be brought to the next meeting;
 - v. Members are interested in receiving the following items to future meetings of the JOSOC:
 - Semi -Conductor facility
 - An understanding of the Metro System and what it means for each area
 - Briefing of all planned projects.

Updated Work Programme

11. At the Committee meeting on 13 September 2018, Members approved the items to include in their work programme for the remainder of the 2018/19 municipal year. This included items at Committee and task group inquiries. The approved work programme was circulated to all Committee Members, Cabinet Members and senior management.
12. Attached at **Appendix A** is the latest version of the Committee's work programme, that shows:
- i. the items considered at Committee meetings to date;
 - ii. the Workshops and Innovation Inquiry has been completed;
 - iii. the Events Inquiry is underway;
 - iv. items from the approved work programme that have changed timing (*shown in green*) ; and
 - v. new items that have emerged since the approved work programme, which Committee has agreed to scrutinise (*shown in blue*).

Committee Forward Plan

13. As part of the Council's response to the Wales Audit Office report '*Overview and Scrutiny - Fit for the Future?*' (July 2018), the Head of Democratic Services has introduced publication of the Committee's "Forward Work Plan" (FWP) on the Council's internet site. The first publication covered items scheduled for October 2018 – January 2019, displayed on the Council's internet site, under the Forward Plan heading.¹
14. The next published FWP will cover the period January 2019 – April 2019. At this meeting, Members are asked to consider the information set out in **Appendix B** and agree for this to be published, subject to any amendments agreed at this meeting.

Way Forward

11. During their meeting, Members will have the opportunity to reflect on the correspondence update, note the information provided on the Joint Overview and Scrutiny Committee Cardiff Capital Region City Deal, discuss the information provided in **Appendices A and B**, and agree whether any amendments are required.

Legal Implications

12. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters, there are no direct legal implications. However, legal implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any legal implications arising from those recommendations. All decisions taken by or on behalf of the Council must (a) be within the legal powers of

¹ Available at: <http://cardiff.moderngov.co.uk/mgListPlans.aspx?RPId=142&RD=0&LLL=0>

the Council; (b) comply with any procedural requirement imposed by law; (c) be within the powers of the body or person exercising powers on behalf of the Council; (d) be undertaken in accordance with the procedural requirements imposed by the Council e.g. Scrutiny Procedure Rules; (e) be fully and properly informed; (f) be properly motivated; (g) be taken having regard to the Council's fiduciary duty to its taxpayers; and (h) be reasonable and proper in all the circumstances.

Financial Implications

13. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters, there are no direct financial implications at this stage in relation to any of the work programme. However, financial implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any financial implications arising from those recommendations.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Committee is recommended to:

- I. Reflect on the update on committee consultation;
- II. Note the update on Joint Overview and Scrutiny Committee for Cardiff Capital Region City Deal; and
- III. Note the updated Work Programme attached at **Appendix A** and agree any amendments required;
- IV. Consider the updated Committee Forward Work Plan attached at **Appendix B**, agree any amendments required and approve for publication on the Council's internet.

Davina Fiore

Director - Governance and Legal Services

30 November 2018

Economy and Culture Scrutiny Committee - Work Programme 2018/2019 - amended 28 November 2018

COMMITTEE MEETINGS	20 August (forum)	13 Sept (CR4)	11 October (CR4)	8 November (CR4)	19 November (Joint Cttee)	6 December (CR4)	17 January (CR4)	TBC (Joint Cttee)	Budget meeting 19 February Tuesday 4.30pm (CR4)	14 March (CR4)	Date TBC (CR4)	9 May (CR4)	6 June (CR4)	4 July (CR4)
Pre-Decision/ Policy Development / Review	ACL Response to WG Consultation	Innovation - Universities perspectives	Cabinet Response - Parks	Harbour Drive - Britannia Park	PSPO Dog Controls: Joint Cttee	Employment Services	GLL scrutiny	PSPO Dog Controls: Joint Cttee	Budget Proposals	Cardiff Sport and Physical Activity Strategy	Metro Central - Cardiff Central Station	ISV Cardiff Bay Regeneration		
				Securing £ - Council owned Heritage Bldgs		Economic Development White Paper	Cardiff East Industrial Strategy		Corporate Plan	Library Strategy	Cardiff Bus Station	Cardiff Harbour Authority		
			Dumballs Road	Multi Purpose Indoor Arena			Dumballs Road (may slip to March)			Multi Purpose Indoor Arena	City Centre & Bay - links/ interface/ highline			
							Innovation (may slip to March)			Securing £ - Council owned Heritage Bldgs				
Committee Business Items		Work Programme & Webcasting	Correspondence	Correspondence		Correspondence/ Work Prog	Correspondence			Correspondence	Correspondence	Correspondence	Correspondence	Correspondence
		Performance		Innovation etc Inquiry report		JOSC City Deal Update	Events Inquiry report					Annual Report		
OUTSIDE COMMITTEE MEETINGS	August	Sept	Oct	Nov		Dec	Jan		Feb	March	Apr	May	June	July
Committee Implementation Inquiries	Innovation/ Workshops Inquiry		Events Inquiry					Sports Inquiry						
Briefings/ information reports outside Committee		Month 4 budget monitoring		Changes to Libraries & Hubs		Month 6 budget monitoring	Cardiff Commitment		Month 9 budget monitoring					Outturn budget monitoring
		Q1 Performance		Libraries Standards & Universal Offers		Q2 Performance monitoring				Q3 Performance			Q4 Performance	

Timing TBC

WAO Leisure Services report

Cardiff Business Forum

Channel View Estate Regen

item as scheduled in Sept 2018

item that has moved/ slipped

new item

ECONOMY & CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE – FORWARD WORK PROGRAMME

January – April 2019

If you would like to share your experiences or views regarding the items being considered please contact:

Scrutinyviewpoints@cardiff.gov.uk

Title and Description of Report	Invitees	Contact Officer
Meeting Date: 17 January 2019		
<p>GLL Scrutiny To review the progress to date in delivering the Leisure Centre Management Partnership between the Council and GLL (Greenwich Leisure Limited).</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cabinet Member, Culture & Leisure • Director of Economic Development • Operational Manager – Parks, Sports and Cardiff Harbour Authority • Leisure Client Manager • GLL representatives 	<p>Principal Scrutiny Officer Angela Holt</p> <p>AHolt@cardiff.gov.uk</p>
<p>Cardiff East Industrial Strategy To carry out pre-decision scrutiny of the draft Cardiff East Industrial Strategy, prior to its consideration by the Cabinet.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cabinet Member, Investment & Development • Director of Economic Development 	<p>Principal Scrutiny Officer Angela Holt</p> <p>AHolt@cardiff.gov.uk</p>
<p>Dumballs Road To carry out pre-decision scrutiny of the report to Cabinet on the Dumballs Road regeneration proposals, prior to its consideration by the Cabinet.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cabinet Member, Investment & Development • Director of Economic Development • Vastint representatives 	<p>Principal Scrutiny Officer Angela Holt</p> <p>AHolt@cardiff.gov.uk</p>

Title and Description of Report	Invitees	Contact Officer
<p>Innovation To carry out pre-decision scrutiny of the report to Cabinet on Innovation, prior to its consideration by the Cabinet.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cabinet Member, Investment & Development • Director of Economic Development 	<p>Principal Scrutiny Officer Angela Holt</p> <p>AHolt@cardiff.gov.uk</p>
Meeting Date: 19 February 2019		
<p>Draft Corporate Plan 2019–2022 and 2019-20 Draft Budgetary Proposals</p> <p>To scrutinise those sections of the Council’s draft Corporate Plan and draft Budgetary Proposals that relate to the portfolios and service areas that fall within the remit of this Committee, prior to it being considered by Cabinet</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Leader • Cabinet Member, Finance, Modernisation & Performance • Cabinet Member, Deputy Leader, Education, Employment & Skills • Cabinet Member, Culture & Leisure • Cabinet Member, Investment & Development • Cabinet Member, Housing & Communities • Corporate Director, People & Communities • Assistant Director, Communities & Housing • Director of Economic Development • Head of Finance • Policy, Partnerships and Citizen Focus Manager 	<p>Principal Scrutiny Officer Angela Holt</p> <p>AHolt@cardiff.gov.uk</p>

Title and Description of Report	Invitees	Contact Officer
Meeting Date: 14 March 2019		
<p>Cardiff Sport & Physical Activity Strategy</p> <p>To carry out pre-decision scrutiny of the draft Cardiff Sport & Physical Activity Strategy, prior to its consideration by the Cabinet.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cabinet Member, Culture & Leisure • Director of Economic Development • Operational Manager – Parks, Sports and Cardiff Harbour Authority • Parks and Sport Development Manager • Cardiff Metropolitan University - representatives 	<p>Principal Scrutiny Officer Angela Holt</p> <p>AHolt@cardiff.gov.uk</p>
<p>Library Strategy</p> <p>To carry out pre-decision scrutiny of the draft Library Strategy, prior to its consideration by the Cabinet.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cabinet Member, Housing & Communities • Assistant Director – Housing & Communities • Lead Library & Strategy Manager 	<p>Principal Scrutiny Officer Angela Holt</p> <p>AHolt@cardiff.gov.uk</p>
<p>Multi-Purpose Indoor Arena</p> <p>To carry out pre-decision scrutiny of a report to Cabinet on a Multi-Purpose Indoor Arena, prior to its consideration by the Cabinet.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cabinet Member, Investment & Development • Director of Economic Development • Finance & Legal representatives • Independent Due Diligence Consultants - representative 	<p>Principal Scrutiny Officer Angela Holt</p> <p>AHolt@cardiff.gov.uk</p>
<p>Securing the future of Council Heritage Buildings</p> <p>To carry out pre-decision scrutiny of a report to Cabinet on the future of Council heritage buildings, prior to its consideration by the Cabinet.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cabinet Member, Investment & Development • Director of Economic Development • Finance & Legal representatives 	<p>Principal Scrutiny Officer Angela Holt</p> <p>AHolt@cardiff.gov.uk</p>

Title and Description of Report	Invitees	Contact Officer
Meeting Date: 4 April 2019		
<p>Cardiff Bus Station</p> <p>To review progress in delivering the Cardiff Bus Station, including the input from the Metro Delivery Partnership, the proposed operator model, the interface between the Council, Transport for Wales, Bus and Coach Companies, the impact on the wider Central Square development and nearby developments, financial implications and risks for the Council and how these are being addressed and mitigated.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Leader • Cabinet Member, Investment & Development • Director of Economic Development • Transport for Wales • Bus Companies – Cardiff Bus, Stagecoach, NAT, Edwards, Newport Bus • Coach Companies – National Express • Bus Users Cymru – passenger representatives 	<p>Principal Scrutiny Officer Angela Holt</p> <p>AHolt@cardiff.gov.uk</p>
<p>Metro Central – Cardiff Central Station</p> <p>To review progress in delivering Metro Central, the impact on the wider Central Square development and nearby developments, financial implications and risks for the Council and how these are being addressed and mitigated.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cabinet Member, Investment & Development • Director of Economic Development 	<p>Principal Scrutiny Officer Angela Holt</p> <p>AHolt@cardiff.gov.uk</p>
<p>City Centre & Bay</p> <p>To review progress in improving linkages between the City Centre and Cardiff Bay.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cabinet Member, Investment & Development • Director of Economic Development 	<p>Principal Scrutiny Officer Angela Holt</p> <p>AHolt@cardiff.gov.uk</p>